



Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>

Second Data Request

15 messages

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>

Wed, Nov 17, 2010 at 5:03 PM

To: "Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)" <Jonathan.Blum@cms.hhs.gov>

Dear Jon,

Attached is a second request for data. I have not heard back from you about my request from November 5. I ask that you respond to this request by November 24, one week from today. I recognize that this is a tight time frame, but the matter is urgent, as I suspect you are aware.

I look forward to assisting you and your team in improving the Medicare auctions. Please let me know how I can be most helpful.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

Economics, Tydings Hall

University of Maryland

College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu voice/fax +1 240 396 1043

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]**Sent:** Friday, November 05, 2010 12:45 PM**To:** Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) (Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov)**Subject:** Follow-up

Dear Jon,

Based on your preliminary decision and statements in the press conference of Nov. 3, I am sending the attached

letter to you as a follow-up. I am also sending a revision of the straw man proposal we discussed on Monday. I have added some new material for clarity. In the interest of transparency, I am posting both on my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> together with other materials.

Following up on a suggestion from Laurence at Monday's meeting, I make some specific data requests in the letter. Let me know if and when I may expect to receive the data.

I look forward to assisting you and your team in improving the Medicare auctions. Please let me know how I can be most helpful.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu voice/fax +1 240 396 1043



cramton-letter-to-blum-medicare-auction-data-request.pdf

239K

Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) <Jonathan.Blum@cms.hhs.gov>

Wed, Nov 17, 2010 at 5:30 PM

To: Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

Jon

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:04 PM

To: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)

Subject: Second Data Request

[Quoted text hidden]

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>

Wed, Nov 17, 2010 at 6:01 PM

To: "Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)" <Jonathan.Blum@cms.hhs.gov>

Many thanks. The data will clarify a lot of issues. I will be sending you several documents later today.

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu voice/fax +1 240 396 1043

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

[Quoted text hidden]

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
To: "Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)" <Jonathan.Blum@cms.hhs.gov>

Sun, Dec 12, 2010 at 12:31 PM

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

["Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment,"](#) Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

["Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid,"](#) Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you

and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com> Sun, Dec 12, 2010 at 12:33 PM
To: Tom Milam <tom@tommilam.com>, "Leggitt, Lance" <lleggitt@bakerdonelson.com>, "Johnson, Nancy" <njohnson@bakerdonelson.com>, Brett Katzman <bkatzman@kennesaw.edu>, "Summa, Jennifer" <jsumma@bakerdonelson.com>, David Green <dgreen@dgreencommunications.com>

CONFIDENTIAL FYI

Professor Peter Cramton
pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]

Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM

To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'

Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"[Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment](#)," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

"[Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid](#)," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
To: sherry.glied@hhs.gov, "Lew, Helen G." <Helen_G._Lew@cea.eop.gov>

Sun, Dec 12, 2010 at 12:36 PM

Sherry and Helen,

FYI. I am continuing to keep CMS informed of my progress. I will let you know if I receive a response.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM
To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: .pdf .pptx]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

Economics, Tydings Hall

University of Maryland

College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
To: tom.bradley@cbo.gov
Cc: Andrew Stocking <Andrew.Stocking@cbo.gov>

Tue, Dec 14, 2010 at 5:35 PM

Dear Tom,

FYI I have made substantial progress in my proposed design for Medicare auctions. Please see below.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM
To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [<mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov>]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
To: mmiller@medpac.gov

Tue, Dec 14, 2010 at 5:36 PM

Dear Mark,

FYI I have made substantial progress in my proposed design for Medicare auctions. Please see below.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>]
Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM
To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]

Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM

To: 'Peter Cramton'

Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]

Mark E. Miller <MMiller@medpac.gov>
To: Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>

Tue, Dec 14, 2010 at 5:38 PM

Thanks for this.

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, December 14, 2010 5:37 PM
To: Mark E. Miller
Subject: FW: Second Data Request

[Quoted text hidden]

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
To: tom.bradley@cbo.gov, william.carrington@cbo.gov
Cc: Andrew Stocking <Andrew.Stocking@cbo.gov>

Thu, Dec 16, 2010 at 5:55 AM

Will,

I just learned that you have joined CBO and perhaps in health care. In any case, I thought you would be interested in my work on the Medicare auctions which I believe will be hugely important to budget matters in the years ahead as market methods expand to control costs in areas beyond DME. See below.

Congrats on your new position. I am sure you will be able to make tremendous contributions to the public good while at CBO.

(Tom and Andy: Will and I grew up in Ann Arbor together long before we even knew about supply and demand.)

Tom (and Andy),

Andy is coordinating a meeting with me and the telecom people on spectrum valuation sometime next week. Perhaps it would be possible to talk with you briefly about Medicare auctions while I am at CBO next week?

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, December 14, 2010 5:35 PM
To: tom.bradley@cbo.gov
Cc: 'Andrew Stocking'
Subject: FW: Second Data Request

Dear Tom,

FYI I have made substantial progress in my proposed design for Medicare auctions. Please see below.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM
To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the

Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]

Tom Bradley <Tom.Bradley@cbo.gov> Thu, Dec 16, 2010 at 6:58 AM
To: Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>, William Carrington <William.Carrington@cbo.gov>
Cc: Andrew Stocking <Andrew.Stocking@cbo.gov>

Hi Peter - -

I'd like to meet while you're here. Please let me know when that will be.

Thanks.

- - Tom

From: Peter Cramton [pcramton@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, December 16, 2010 5:55 AM
To: Tom Bradley; William Carrington
Cc: Andrew Stocking
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Will,

I just learned that you have joined CBO and perhaps in health care. In any case, I thought you would be interested in my work on the Medicare auctions which I believe will be hugely important to budget matters in the years ahead as market methods expand to control costs in areas beyond DME. See below.

Congrats on your new position. I am sure you will be able to make tremendous contributions to the public good while at CBO.

(Tom and Andy: Will and I grew up in Ann Arbor together long before we even knew about supply and demand.)

Tom (and Andy),

Andy is coordinating a meeting with me and the telecom people on spectrum valuation sometime next week. Perhaps it would be possible to talk with you briefly about Medicare auctions while I am at CBO next week?

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
pcramton@gmail.com<<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>> www.cramton.umd.edu<<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/>>
+1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>]
Sent: Tuesday, December 14, 2010 5:35 PM
To: tom.bradley@cbo.gov
Cc: 'Andrew Stocking'
Subject: FW: Second Data Request

Dear Tom,

FYI I have made substantial progress in my proposed design for Medicare auctions. Please see below.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
pcramton@gmail.com<<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>> www.cramton.umd.edu<<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/>>
+1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>]
Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM
To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions

and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," <<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/papers2010-2014/cramton-auction-design-for-medicare.pdf>> Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: .pdf<<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/papers2010-2014/cramton-auction-design-for-medicare-slides.pdf>> .pptx<<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/papers2010-2014/cramton-auction-design-for-medicare-slides.pptx>>]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," <<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/papers2010-2014/cramton-change-in-market-structure-from-rebid.pdf>> Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com<<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>> www.cramton.umd.edu<<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/>>
+1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [<mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov>]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

Jon

From: Peter Cramton [<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:04 PM
To: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)
Subject: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

Attached is a second request for data. I have not heard back from you about my request from November 5. I ask that you respond to this request by November 24, one week from today. I recognize that this is a tight time frame, but the matter is urgent, as I suspect you are aware.

I look forward to assisting you and your team in improving the Medicare auctions. Please let me know how I can be most helpful.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com<<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>> www.cramton.umd.edu<<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/>>
voice/fax +1 240 396 1043

From: Peter Cramton [<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>]
Sent: Friday, November 05, 2010 12:45 PM
To: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) (Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov)
Subject: Follow-up

Dear Jon,

Based on your preliminary decision and statements in the press conference of Nov. 3, I am sending the attached letter to you as a follow-up. I am also sending a revision of the straw man proposal we discussed on Monday. I have added some new material for clarity. In the interest of transparency, I am posting both on my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> together with other materials.

Following up on a suggestion from Laurence at Monday's meeting, I make some specific data requests in the letter. Let me know if and when I may expect to receive the data.

I look forward to assisting you and your team in improving the Medicare auctions. Please let me know how I can be most helpful.

Best,
Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
pcramton@gmail.com<<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>> www.cramton.umd.edu<<http://www.cramton.umd.edu/>>
voice/fax +1 240 396 1043

William Carrington <William.Carrington@cbo.gov>
To: Tom Bradley <Tom.Bradley@cbo.gov>, Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
Cc: Andrew Stocking <Andrew.Stocking@cbo.gov>

Thu, Dec 16, 2010 at 10:08 AM

That would be great, Peter. I had read a little about what you've been doing on Medicare auctions but would be happy to learn more. I'll be around through Wednesday of next week and am almost uniformly available those first three days. Just let me know what times might work for you.
Of course, after an abominable trip on the red line this morning, I'm more curious about your thoughts on Metro auctions.

[Quoted text hidden]

Mon, Dec 20, 2010 at 5:35 PM

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>To: "Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)" <Jonathan.Blum@cms.hhs.gov>

Dear Jon,

Last week I had a conference call with 156 representatives from the HME provider community in which I discussed my proposal for 90 minutes and answered questions. I received many pages of questions most of which were helpful. I have made a number of minor updates to my materials in response to these comments. Please see the latest at

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Full Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#); [Short Presentation](#); [One Page](#)]

One of the comments was to present a cliff note version that would highlight the basics. I have done so in the "Short Presentation" which is just 12 slides, which allows it to be printed on "One Page" two-sided.

The short version is attached in pptx.

Have a wonderful holiday!

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>]

Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM

To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'

Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

Economics, Tydings Hall

University of Maryland

College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]

Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]

 **cramton-auction-design-for-medicare-short.pptx**
85K

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
To: mmiller@medpac.gov

Mon, Dec 20, 2010 at 5:36 PM

Mark,

FYI

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, December 20, 2010 5:35 PM
To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

Last week I had a conference call with 156 representatives from the HME provider community in which I discussed my proposal for 90 minutes and answered questions. I received many pages of questions most of which were helpful. I have made a number of minor updates to my materials in response to these comments. Please see the latest at

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Full Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#); Short Presentation; [One Page](#)]

One of the comments was to present a cliff note version that would highlight the basics. I have done so in the "Short Presentation" which is just 12 slides, which allows it to be printed on "One Page" two-sided.

The short version is attached in pptx.

Have a wonderful holiday!

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]

Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM

To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'

Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]



cramton-auction-design-for-medicare-short.pptx
85K

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>
To: tom.bradley@cbo.gov
Cc: Andrew Stocking <Andrew.Stocking@cbo.gov>, william.carrington@cbo.gov

Mon, Dec 20, 2010 at 5:45 PM

Tom,

FYI. I think this one-pager version will provide a good basis for our discussions on Wednesday. It omits the flaws

of the current program. I am happy to go into the flaws and the implications of the flaws, but I suspect we already have consensus on the flaws. I will also be able to talk about the scoring implications of the current program and the proposed revisions.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]

Sent: Monday, December 20, 2010 5:35 PM

To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'

Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

Last week I had a conference call with 156 representatives from the HME provider community in which I discussed my proposal for 90 minutes and answered questions. I received many pages of questions most of which were helpful. I have made a number of minor updates to my materials in response to these comments. Please see the latest at

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Full Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#); Short Presentation; [One Page](#)]

One of the comments was to present a cliff note version that would highlight the basics. I have done so in the "Short Presentation" which is just 12 slides, which allows it to be printed on "One Page" two-sided.

The short version is attached in pptx.

Have a wonderful holiday!

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]

Sent: Sunday, December 12, 2010 12:32 PM

To: 'Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM)'

Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Dear Jon,

This is a friendly reminder that I have heard nothing from your team about either my request for data on November 5, nor my second request for data on November 17.

As you know I am working hard to develop materials for your team to identify problems with the CMS auctions and more importantly to improve the CMS DME auction program. My work will be enhanced with better data from CMS.

Even without the additional data I have made substantial progress on my analysis of the Round 1 Rebid and in the development of an effective auction design for DME. Please see my web site at <http://www.cramton.umd.edu/auction-papers.htm#Medicare> for important revisions to these documents:

"Auction Design for Medicare Durable Medical Equipment," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010. [Presentation: [.pdf](#) [.pptx](#)]

"Medicare Auction Failure: Early Evidence from the Round 1 Rebid," Working Paper, University of Maryland, December 2010.

The first paper (in presentation form) is a fairly complete analysis of the CMS auctions (theory, experiment, and field results) and then a detailed presentation of a proposed design.

The second paper presents an analysis of the radical change in market structure that will occur as a result of the Round 1 Rebid.

I would be happy to meet with you to discuss my proposal. As you will see, with this revision, I have simplified and refined the auction design to account for useful suggestions I received in my November 1 meeting with you and then in a subsequent November 22 meeting with Sherry Glied and representatives from the White House.

Please let me know when it would be convenient to meet again. And please do ask your team to work to respond promptly to my data requests. There is no time for delay on this critical matter. Finally, please note my new phone number below.

Best,

Peter

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics, Tydings Hall
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742-7211

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

From: Blum, Jonathan D. (CMS/CM) [mailto:Jonathan.Blum@CMS.hhs.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, November 17, 2010 5:31 PM
To: 'Peter Cramton'
Subject: RE: Second Data Request

Peter, we are looking into your request for information. We'll be back in touch as soon as I can.

[Quoted text hidden]



cramton-auction-design-for-medicare-short.pptx
85K